

**MINUTES OF THE 16<sup>TH</sup> ECOSAI TRAINING COMMITTEE MEETING,**  
**17<sup>TH</sup> OCTOBER, 2016, ANKARA, TURKEY**

1. The 16<sup>th</sup> Training Committee Meeting (TCM) of ECOSAI was held at Ankara, Turkey on 17<sup>th</sup> October, 2016. The meeting was attended by delegates from SAIs of Afghanistan, Iran, Pakistan and Turkey.
2. Ms Nevin Atakan Head of Training Department, Turkish Court of Accounts opened the meeting and welcomed the members of the Training Committee to Ankara. This was followed by a brief introduction to the agenda and the activities of TCM of ECOSAI by SAI Pakistan. After this the individual agenda items were discussed.
3. The Committee deliberated on the following agenda items:
  1. **Follow-up on the 15<sup>th</sup> Training Committee Meeting decisions.**
    - i. **Follow-up on the decision proposed by SAI Turkey in case of TIKA Courses to implement the model of translating the training material for improved participation by SAI's in ECOSAI Training courses.**

A brief introduction and background of the issue at hand was presented by SAI Pakistan and after deliberations, SAI Turkey presented four proposals on the forum: Firstly, SAI Turkey proposed to organise one TIKA sponsored training course for a longer duration in the Spring season. After this, SAI Turkey proposed that a training course be organized by one of the member SAIs of ECOSAI following this course, in case no other SAI expresses willingness to organise a training course, then SAI Turkey will organise a second program but this would be a seminar, workshop or a symposium. Then SAI Turkey also suggested to introduce an Internship program for two months with the TCA for which TCA will work out the modalities once the proposal is accepted by GBM. Lastly, the TCA intimated that it would also like to invite experts in different fields from other member SAIs to share valuable knowledge and experiences in addition to the trainees. While specifically discussing the issue of translations SAI Turkey also expressed the views that the translations into different languages may be very expensive and may not be feasible based on the experience of previous training courses and medium of instructions should remain the official language of ECOSAI i.e., English.

During discussion, the members of TCM also expressed their views on the general issue of training for ECOSAI member states in which SAI Iran stated that the training programs should be effective and result oriented. The emphasis should be on improving the skills of the colleagues and not just teaching theoretical knowledge. SAI Afghanistan expressed the opinion that Performance Audit and IT Audit trainings should be conducted which will be beneficial for the members.

SAI Pakistan concluded that a combination of short and long duration training courses certainly seemed useful for member SAIs. Once decision is taken by the GBM, feasibility for long duration training courses and proposals given by SAI Turkey may be devised.



**ii) Follow-up on the technical issues explored by SAI Pakistan regarding the likely format of posting news items on the ECOSAI Website.**

The new and updated version of website was displayed to the members by SAI Pakistan which was appreciated by all the participants. All the SAls appreciated the step of allocating dedicated portions for each SAI on the web-site of ECOSAI where they can enter their information themselves. SAI Pakistan demonstrated how the member SAls can upload their news items, photographs and videos on the website. SAI Iran opined that the new website is useful and members of SAls will be willing to update and suggested that heads of units responsible for international activities in individual SAls should update the website. The respective SAls may appoint liaison officers in their domains to discuss with the Secretariat technical matters encountered in updating their respective information. SAI Turkey suggested that all documents should be in a uniform format so that information can be shared easily, the videos should not be too long and may include; speeches/messages by the heads of SAI, presentations/trainings delivered, updates relating to standards, best practices followed internationally or in case of individual SAls etc. SAI Iran proposed that the posting of items on website should include selective material like notifications, news, documentation, information of training courses and that extensive details should be avoided. SAI Afghanistan stated that translation of content of website into Persian language will be useful for their common citizens as well.

It was agreed that the respective SAI may use their allocated portion of websites to post news items and other materials in their respective languages with the translation in English. ECOSAI Secretariat will send login and password information to SAls individually enabling them to make any changes in their allocated portions of web-site. It was a general feeling that format and contents of the items to be uploaded on website need to be decided first through communication via email to give a homogenous and uniform appearance to the website. The website will be developed using the ECOSAI funds as has been the practice in the past.

SAI Pakistan agreed with the consensus that they will circulate TOR's for uploading the material and videos after the meetings.

**iii. Follow-up on the discussion for signing MOUs between SAls for bilateral cooperation including trainings.**

During the 20<sup>th</sup> ECOSAI GBM it was decided that to further promote public sector accountability and enhanced transparency in the public sector, the ECOSAI member SAls may enter into formal agreements through Memorandums of Understanding (MoU). This objective will be met through strengthening of bilateral relations resulting in dissemination of best practices and facilitating capacity building through formalized arrangements. Updating on this account it was informed that upto now, SAI Pakistan has signed MoU with SAI Iran, MoU with the SAI Turkey has also been finalized and the same will also be signed after the meeting of GBM, whereas the MoU between SAls Pakistan and Tajikistan is at negotiation stage. SAI Iran informed that it has entered into MoU with SAI Turkey and Tajikistan and SAI Afghanistan informed that it has signed an MoU with SAI Turkey. The above situation was viewed as an encouraging sign for the ECOSAI in its efforts to try and promote bilateral relations for knowledge and experience sharing.



**iv. Follow-up on the training material for scheduled training courses for the year 2016 to be provided in advance of actual conduct of courses.**

SAI Pakistan informed about the successful completion of training courses by SAIs Iran and Turkey in March 2016 and May 2016. While discussing the issue further it was also reiterated that SAIs hosting trainings should try to send the training material well in time to the ECOSAI member SAIs before actual commencement of the training courses. It was observed that the logistics were arranged satisfactorily and the training material were conveyed well before commencing of the training courses.

SAI Iran proposed that focal person from SAIs may be assigned to translate the courses into Russian, Persian and Turkish language etc. SAI Afghanistan suggested that a soft copy of course content may be sent to participating SAI to become familiar with the subject. SAI Turkey was of the view that sending training material 3 months in advance may not be possible as the trainers like to amend their presentations till close to the holding of the courses. SAI Pakistan clarified that intent of sending course material early was that the outlines of the course, duration and names of presenters and other such information may be sent as soon as possible and the training presentations may be sent as and when they are finally revised so as to enable the SAIs to get necessary approvals and select appropriate candidates.

In view of above suggestions, it was decided that the training material will be sent for familiarization of the subject matter to the respective SAIs at the earliest possible time. The SAIs should be given enough time to translate the training material in their preferred language if they so desire and decide upon the level of participation in the meetings.

**v. Follow-up on the suggestion of Turkey to depute trainers from SAI Pakistan for TIKA and for other SAI's depending on their competencies as an alternative to only inviting trainees for training courses.**

The meeting was informed by the SAI Pakistan that on the suggestion of SAI Turkey, the SAI Pakistan deputed three trainers for delivery of training course/ seminar on 'Implementation of ISSAIs' in March 2016. The course was conducted successfully and the feedback of participants was encouraging.

SAI Turkey proposed that there should be regular Training Need Analysis (TNA) for trainings by the Secretary General. Database about the experts, their capacities and specialization should be developed. SAI Iran proposed that all SAIs need to assess their training requirements and decide upon their desired fields of training. Similarly database about trainers having particular expertise, knowledge and facilitation needs to be developed.

**vi. Follow-up on the uploading of training material on ECOSAI Website.**

SAI Pakistan informed that it has explored the possibility of uploading training material on ECOSAI Website in consultation with M/s COMSATS Islamabad who are hosting the present website of the ECOSAI. It was further informed that the training related videos can be uploaded on the website. The issues that need to be discussed are the



extent to which the member SAIs would like to use the web-site for the training related activities i.e., would they like to host the complete videos on the website or would like to provide links to the original videos on ECOSAI website only. Further would the videos only show the trainers or the whole environment of the training course including the trainees, their questions and discussions during the delivery of course. This would determine the cost of maintenance of the web-site and its annual charges.

SAI Iran suggested that training material should be uploaded on the website but there should be a consensus on the format of uploaded videos and in this regard further suggested that training programs may not be uploaded fully, instead important sections of the videos may be added on the website.

It was decided that the extent of uploading material on website will be further discussed and after discussion through emails it will be decided which formats of the training videos can be uploaded on the website i.e. should the whole videos be uploaded or only the trainer should be focused without showing surrounding environment.

**vii. Follow-up on the updation of Strategic plan and the decision to present it in GBM.**

The TCM was informed by the SAI Pakistan that the committee comprising representatives from SAIs of Iran, Pakistan and Turkey formed during 20<sup>th</sup> Governing Board Meeting of ECOSAI had prepared a draft of ECOSAI Strategic Plan for 2016-2021 after detailed correspondence via emails, discussion and a meeting held from May 29 to June 1, 2016 at Ankara, Turkey. The ECOSAI Strategic Plan for 2016-2021 was circulated among member SAIs for comments and their feedback were incorporated in the draft plan. The 16<sup>th</sup> ECOSAI training committee was informed that the draft of ECOSAI Strategic Plan for 2016-2021 will be presented before the members of the Governing Board for comments and approval before submitting it to the ECOSAI Assembly. Preparation of ECOSAI Strategic Plan 2016-2021 was appreciated by the members.

**viii. Follow-up on presentation made by SAI Iran on LMS.**

SAI Iran had presented the concept of Learning Management System (LMS) during 15<sup>th</sup> TCM, the likely benefits from the concept of LMS and actual benefits that the SAI Iran received from implementation of LMS. It was suggested that this concept be considered for implementation by other SAIs besides using the forum of ECOSAI to promote the idea. The concept was well received and it was decided to intimate the concept to other member SAIs of ECOSAI besides using web-site of ECOSAI to facilitate its implementation. It was again reiterated during the meeting that SAI Iran may use the ECOSAI website to further disseminate the concept.

**2. The SAI Pakistan proposes placing the electronic version of courses conducted for ECOSAI countries for lesser costs and greater participation of SAIs.**

The SAI Pakistan checked the possibility of uploading of training material on ECOSAI Website. Since this issue related to the website development and placing training



material on the website this agenda item was discussed while discussing agenda item 1(vi) above with the permission of chair.

**3. The SAI Pakistan suggests a blended learning program on ISSAIs incorporating both online and face to face training.**

SAI Pakistan briefly introduced the concept of blended learning program on ISSAIs. As per the programme, two sets of activities are included:

(1) Online and (2) face to face workshops. The model is already being used by IDI in their capacity building programme.

The training committee appreciated this proposal of SAI Pakistan and it was decided that TNA may be carried out before implementing this system.

**4. Discussion on the proposal of SAI Kazakhstan for participation in ECOSAI training courses/ reimburse the return air ticket from ECOSAI funds to the representatives from their regional audit office which is an independent body.**

Training committee discussed the issue raised by the SAI Kazakhstan for participation of representatives from their Regional Audit Commissions which are independent bodies and are not part of SAI Kazakhstan, in ECOSAI training courses and also to reimburse the return air ticket from ECOSAI funds.

It was decided that presently, as the ECOSAI is facing shortage of funds so it was not possible to reimburse the amount of air tickets to the members of the independent bodies and this facility should be availed by SAIs only. Training material may anyhow be distributed among members well in time.

**5. The Accounts Chamber of the Republic of Tajikistan has proposed in its comments on the ECOSAI Strategic Plan 2016-2021 clause 3.2. to provide workshops and training with simultaneous translation into Russian as most ECOSAI member SAIs are members of the CIS members states where the working language is Russian. SAI Iran proposed to discuss this as an agenda items and if agreed in GBM be made part of ECOSAI Strategic Plan 2016-2021.**

Training committee discussed the issue raised by the Accounts Chamber of the Republic of Tajikistan to provide workshops and training with simultaneous translation into Russian. It was decided that as English is the official language of ECOSAI therefore the courses will be conducted in English and the host SAI may consider providing translations. The training material may be sent to the SAIs who may translate the training material into respective languages for their participants.

**6. Discussion on training plan implementation and progress.**

SAI Pakistan informed the members of TCM that under the ECOSAI Training Plan 2014-2017 the SAI Turkey has successfully arranged a training course/ seminar on "Implementation of ISSAIs" in March 2016, and SAI Iran has arranged a course on "Environmental Auditing" in May 2016. SAI Pakistan had also planned to host a course

for the members of ECOSAI on "Performance Audit" from September 19-30, 2016 at Lahore, Pakistan and also announced the course schedule. As enough nominations were not received from the ECOSAI member SAIs therefore, the course was postponed and now proposed dates for the course are December 5-16, 2016. It is expected that a considerable number of participants from all member SAIs will attend the course. The progress on training plan can be deemed satisfactory. As the present training plan ends in the year 2017 so it was suggested that the next training committee may formulate the next training plan for 2018-2021. SAI Iran proposed that each SAI should organise atleast one training program. SAI Turkey suggested that there should be permanent staff in each SAI to deal with training related matters. Since this matters related to individual SAIs so it was decided to let these issues be dealt by the respective SAIs themselves.

**7. Other matters**

**No issues were discussed under other matters.**

The meeting ended with a vote of thanks for the chair.

**Afghanistan:**

  
Mr. Bashir Ahmad RASHIDY, Director


**Iran:**

  
Mr. Mandi DEHROUYEH, Advisor to President

**Pakistan:**

  
Mr. Khurram Raza QURESHI, Director General

**Turkey:**

  
Ms. Nevin ATAKAN, Head of Training Center